

Article Code: _____ Coder initials: _____

Date coded : _____

Quality Criteria for Medical Reporting: Coding Form
Abstract, Editor Note, Press Release

A.	Study Description	Abstract	Editor Note	Press release
1.	Does this document exist for this study?	NA	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
2.	What is the study design?	<input type="checkbox"/> Meta-analysis of RCTs <input type="checkbox"/> Meta-analysis of observational studies <input type="checkbox"/> Randomized controlled trial <input type="checkbox"/> Controlled trial without randomization <input type="checkbox"/> Cohort study <input type="checkbox"/> Case-control study <input type="checkbox"/> Survey--Cross sectional <input type="checkbox"/> Survey—longitudinal <input type="checkbox"/> Cross sectional-other <input type="checkbox"/> Longitudinal-other <input type="checkbox"/> Case series (no control group) <input type="checkbox"/> Gene association study <input type="checkbox"/> Can't tell <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____	NA	NA
3.	Who/what are the study subjects?	<input type="checkbox"/> Real people <input type="checkbox"/> Hypothetical people <input type="checkbox"/> Animals <input type="checkbox"/> Lab experiments (e.g., cells, blood) <input type="checkbox"/> Other (e.g., hospitals, tests) <input type="checkbox"/> Can't tell	NA	NA
4.	Study exposures: What is being compared to what (exposures)? <i>If no comparison is being made, include the condition or illness common to people in the study (e.g., people with West Nile virus).</i>	Write in:	NA	<input type="checkbox"/> Exact or partial match with abstract <input type="checkbox"/> Incorrect exposure(s) <input type="checkbox"/> No clear statement of exposures
5.	Study outcomes: What is the primary outcome, measure, scale, or variable (e.g., blood pressure, survival, death)? <i>Outcome Rules:</i> Pick a positive finding from the primary outcome (or first outcome if more than one) from the conclusion. Or, pick a secondary outcome if that is the focus of the press release.	Write in:	NA	<input type="checkbox"/> Exact or partial match with primary outcome(s) <input type="checkbox"/> Incorrect outcome(s): Outcomes incorrectly stated (e.g., use disease instead of score or report wrong outcomes) <input type="checkbox"/> Secondary outcome: only a secondary outcome is discussed in the press release <input type="checkbox"/> No clear statement of outcome
6.	Does the study conclusion demonstrate a positive health benefit from the Tx, intervention, or test?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No --for example, not a comparison study (i.e., prevalence study), study assesses harms, study results are negative	NA	NA
7.	Is the time frame mentioned for the abstract's main result (e.g., "over[time period]", lifetime risk, 10-yr risk)? Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> Study not designed to assess benefit/risk/prognosis over time	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, numbers given <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, verbal labels only <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, numbers given <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, verbal labels only <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, numbers given <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, verbal labels only <input type="checkbox"/> No

Article Code: _____ Coder initials: _____

Date coded : _____

B.	Numbers	Abstract	Editor Note	Press release
1.	How is the main result (e.g. exposure, benefit, risk) described? a) Single-person anecdote b) Numbers given	NA <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
2.	If numbers are provided:			
	a) Does the main result show a statistically significant difference?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> No difference tested (e.g., descriptive surveys, prevalence)	N/A	N/A
	b) How are the numbers given? --If multiple numbers, choose a primary outcome number that is nearest the top of this list) --Use blank space to write in the numbers you are coding	<input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk/means for more than one or all exposure groups <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk /mean for only one exposure group (e.g. 5% or 5 per 100 had strokes in the control group) <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for more than one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for only one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Number needed to treat (e.g. 500 need to be treated to prevent 1 death) <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute difference only (e.g. 5 fewer cases per 1000 women) <input type="checkbox"/> Ratio measure only (e.g. relative risk, relative change - % higher or lower; pop attr risk) <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____	<input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk/means for more than one or all exposure groups <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk /mean for only one exposure group (e.g. 5% or 5 per 100 had strokes in the control group) <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for more than one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for only one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Number needed to treat (e.g. 500 need to be treated to prevent 1 death) <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute difference only (e.g. 5 fewer cases per 1000 women) <input type="checkbox"/> Ratio measure only (e.g. relative risk, relative change - % higher or lower; pop attr risk) <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____	<input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk/means for more than one or all exposure groups <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk /mean for only one exposure group (e.g. 5% or 5 per 100 had strokes in the control group) <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for more than one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for only one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Number needed to treat (e.g. 500 need to be treated to prevent 1 death) <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute difference only (e.g. 5 fewer cases per 1000 women) <input type="checkbox"/> Ratio measure only (e.g. relative risk, relative change - % higher or lower; pop attr risk) <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____
	c) Are the data presented in the same numeric format (can be a subset) as the abstract?	N/A	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as abstract <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as abstract <input type="checkbox"/> No
	d) Are the data presented in the same numeric format (can be a subset) as the editor's note? Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> No editor's note	N/A	N/A	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as editor's note <input type="checkbox"/> No
	e) Where do the press release numbers come from? [if more than one, choose box with the lowest number] Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> No press release	N/A	N/A	<input type="checkbox"/> 1) Article abstract <input type="checkbox"/> 4) Author quote <input type="checkbox"/> 2) Editor's note <input type="checkbox"/> 5) Other _____ <input type="checkbox"/> 3) Article body
	f) Were the numbers used correctly? g). If numbers used incorrectly, provide text used to describe the numbers & reason why it is incorrect:	N/A	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Unsure (not known where # is from) If unsure, put number: _____ Incorrect text: Reason incorrect	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Unsure (not known where # is from) If unsure, put number: _____ Incorrect text: Reason incorrect

Article Code: _____ Coder initials: _____

Date coded : _____

C.	Harms	Abstract	Editor Note	Press release
1.	Are relevant harms or adverse events mentioned?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
2.	If harms or adverse events are mentioned:			
	How are harms/adverse effects described? a) Single-person anecdote b) Numbers given	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
	c) If numbers are provided for harms, how are they given?	<input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk/means for more than one or all exposure groups <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk /mean for only one exposure group (e.g. 5% or 5 per 100 had strokes in the control group) <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for more than one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for only one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Number needed to treat (e.g. 500 need to be treated to prevent 1 death) <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute difference only (e.g. 5 fewer cases per 1000 women) <input type="checkbox"/> Ratio measure only (e.g. relative risk, relative change - % higher or lower; pop attr risk) <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____	<input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk/means for more than one or all exposure groups <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk /mean for only one exposure group (e.g. 5% or 5 per 100 had strokes in the control group) <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for more than one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for only one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Number needed to treat (e.g. 500 need to be treated to prevent 1 death) <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute difference only (e.g. 5 fewer cases per 1000 women) <input type="checkbox"/> Ratio measure only (e.g. relative risk, relative change - % higher or lower; pop attr risk) <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____	<input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk/means for more than one or all exposure groups <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk /mean for only one exposure group (e.g. 5% or 5 per 100 had strokes in the control group) <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for more than one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for only one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Number needed to treat (e.g. 500 need to be treated to prevent 1 death) <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute difference only (e.g. 5 fewer cases per 1000 women) <input type="checkbox"/> Ratio measure only (e.g. relative risk, relative change - % higher or lower; pop attr risk) <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____
	c) Are harms presented in the same numeric format (can be a subset) as the abstract ?	N/A	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as abstract <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as abstract <input type="checkbox"/> No
	d) Are harms presented in the same numeric format (can be a subset) as the editor's note ? Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> No editor's note	N/A	N/A	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as editor's note <input type="checkbox"/> No
	f) Were the numbers for harms used correctly? g). If numbers used incorrectly , provide text used to describe the numbers & reason why it is incorrect:	N/A	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Unsure (not known where # is from) If unsure, put number: _____ Incorrect text: Reason incorrect	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Unsure (not known where # is from) If unsure, put number: _____ Incorrect text: Reason incorrect

Article Code: _____ Coder initials: _____

Date coded : _____

For Limitations: If the question does not apply, mark the appropriate “opt out” choice from the first column and leave the rest of the row blank

D.	Limitations	Abstract	Editor Note	Press release
1.	Is the study size given? (exact or approximate number)	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
2.	<p>If the study is small (e.g. < 30 people), are readers cautioned that larger studies are needed to really understand how much the intervention works?</p> <p>Opt out:</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not a small study OR</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> No study size given in abstract</p>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
3.	<p>If study has no control or comparison group, are readers cautioned that it is not known how much the intervention accounts for the findings?</p> <p>Opt out:</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Control/comparison group present</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Study not intended to identify benefit of an intervention</p>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
4.	<p>If study is a randomized trial, (randomized assignment to exposure groups), is that fact clearly identified?</p> <p>Opt out:</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Study is NOT a randomized trial</p>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
5.	<p>If the study is a randomized trial, and the study was stopped early due to benefit (not harm), is there a caution that these studies often overestimate this benefit?</p> <p>Opt out:</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Study is NOT a randomized trial</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Study is randomized but did NOT stop early for benefit</p>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
6.	<p>If the study is NOT randomized, is the potential for confounding noted (e.g., in the analysis)?</p> <p>Opt out:</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Study IS a randomized trial</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Confounding not applicable (no cause & effect implied, e.g., descriptive study)</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes, explicitly (mentions confounding as a potential problem)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes, generally (mentions multivariate analysis, says “just an association” or “RCT needed”)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes, explicitly (mentions confounding as a potential problem)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes, generally (mentions multivariate analysis, says “just an association” or “RCT needed”)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes, explicitly (mentions confounding as a potential problem)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes, generally (mentions multivariate analysis, says “just an association” or “RCT needed”)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> No</p>
7.	<p>If cross-sectional study, is it noted that since the information is collected simultaneously, you cannot know whether the exposure causes the outcome (or vice-versa)?</p> <p>Opt out:</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not a cross-sectional study or not simultaneous exposures & outcomes</p>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
8.	<p>If study is a survey,</p> <p>a) is the response rate given?</p> <p>b) If the sample is not random (e.g., convenience or self-selected), is the reader cautioned about sample bias?</p> <p>Part b opt out:</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Survey sample is random</p> <p>Opt out:</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not a survey</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>	<p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No</p>
9.	<p>If the study is descriptive (e.g., no intervention, prevalence studies), is there a statement about how well the sample represents a larger population?</p> <p>Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> Not a descriptive study</p>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

Article Code: _____ Coder initials: _____

Date coded : _____

D.	Limitations, continued	Abstract	Editor Note	Press release
10.	If diet/behavior/quality improvement intervention with multiple dimensions (type and/or duration vary), are readers cautioned that it is difficult to determine which dimension is responsible for the effect? Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> Drug study <input type="checkbox"/> Study not intended to identify benefit of an intervention <input type="checkbox"/> Not a multiple intervention study	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
11.	If the primary outcome is a surrogate marker (e.g., lab abnormality) , are readers cautioned about extrapolating to health outcomes important to patients? Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> Not a surrogate outcome	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
12.	If primary outcome is a score or surrogate marker , are readers told whether the effect is clinically important or unimportant (or unknown) ? a) Mentions this explicitly ("small" effect) b) If score , are numbers provided relative to entire score (0.6mm out of 10cm)? <input type="checkbox"/> Opt out of b – score not relevant to this outcome Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> Not a score/surrogate outcome <input type="checkbox"/> Negative study (shows no difference) <input type="checkbox"/> No difference tested in the abstract	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
13.	If the study is based on a decision model , is the hypothetical nature of the analysis clearly identified? Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> Not a decision model	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
14.	If the study is an animal or lab experiment , is there a caution about the limited applicability to human health? Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> Not an animal model or lab experiment	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
15.	Is the study funding source stated?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
16.	a. Other limitations in the abstract or editor's note : List briefly and number any other limitations mentioned. The goal is to track these limitations through the press release and news stories. Put "none" if no limitations.			List the numbers for any limitation from the abstract/editor's note that are mentioned in the press release:
	b. How many unique limitations are mentioned in 16a ?	# of unique limitations in abstract & editor's note:		# of these limitations listed in the press release (from above):
	c. List any other limitations in the press release that are NOT mentioned in the abstract or editor's note?	NA	NA	

Any other comments or notes?

Article Code: _____ Coder initials: _____

Date coded : _____

Quality Criteria for Medical Reporting: Coding Form News stories

A.	Study Description	News story # _____	News story # _____	News story # _____
1.	<p>Is the news story clear about what is being compared to what (exposures)?</p> <p><i>If no comparison is being made, include the condition or illness common to people in the study (e.g., people with West Nile virus).</i></p>	<input type="checkbox"/> Exact or partial match with abstract <input type="checkbox"/> Incorrect exposure(s) <input type="checkbox"/> No clear statement of exposures	<input type="checkbox"/> Exact or partial match with abstract <input type="checkbox"/> Incorrect exposure(s) <input type="checkbox"/> No clear statement of exposures	<input type="checkbox"/> Exact or partial match with abstract <input type="checkbox"/> Incorrect exposure(s) <input type="checkbox"/> No clear statement of exposures
2.	<p>Is the outcome discussed in the abstract also the primary outcome in the news story?</p>	<input type="checkbox"/> Exact or partial match with primary outcome(s) <input type="checkbox"/> Incorrect outcome(s): Outcomes incorrectly stated (e.g., use disease instead of score or report wrong outcomes) <input type="checkbox"/> Secondary outcome : only a secondary outcome is discussed in the news story <input type="checkbox"/> No clear statement of outcome	<input type="checkbox"/> Exact or partial match with primary outcome(s) <input type="checkbox"/> Incorrect outcome(s): Outcomes incorrectly stated (e.g., use disease instead of score or report wrong outcomes) <input type="checkbox"/> Secondary outcome : only a secondary outcome is discussed in the news story <input type="checkbox"/> No clear statement of outcome	<input type="checkbox"/> Exact or partial match with primary outcome(s) <input type="checkbox"/> Incorrect outcome(s): Outcomes incorrectly stated (e.g., use disease instead of score or report wrong outcomes) <input type="checkbox"/> Secondary outcome : only a secondary outcome is discussed in the news story <input type="checkbox"/> No clear statement of outcome
3.	<p>Is the time frame mentioned for the abstract's main result (e.g., "over[time period]", lifetime risk, 10-yr risk)?</p> <p>Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> Study not designed to assess benefit/risk/prognosis over time </p>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, numbers given <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, verbal labels only <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, numbers given <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, verbal labels only <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, numbers given <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, verbal labels only <input type="checkbox"/> No

Article Code: _____ Coder initials: _____

Date coded : _____

B.	Numbers—Is the study quantified and if so, how?	News story # _____	News story # _____	News story # _____
1.	How is the main result (e.g. exposure, benefit, risk) described? a) Single-person anecdote b) Numbers given	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
2.	If numbers are provided: b) How are the numbers given? --If multiple numbers, choose a primary outcome number that is nearest the top of this list) --Use blank space to write in the numbers you are coding	<input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk/means for more than one or all exposure groups <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk /mean for only one exposure group (e.g. 5% or 5 per 100 had strokes in the control group) <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for more than one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for only one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Number needed to treat (e.g. 500 need to be treated to prevent 1 death) <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute difference only (e.g. 5 fewer cases per 1000 women) <input type="checkbox"/> Ratio measure only (e.g. relative risk, relative change - % higher or lower; pop attr risk) <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____	<input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk/means for more than one or all exposure groups <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk /mean for only one exposure group (e.g. 5% or 5 per 100 had strokes in the control group) <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for more than one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for only one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Number needed to treat (e.g. 500 need to be treated to prevent 1 death) <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute difference only (e.g. 5 fewer cases per 1000 women) <input type="checkbox"/> Ratio measure only (e.g. relative risk, relative change - % higher or lower; pop attr risk) <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____	<input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk/means for more than one or all exposure groups <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk /mean for only one exposure group (e.g. 5% or 5 per 100 had strokes in the control group) <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for more than one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for only one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Number needed to treat (e.g. 500 need to be treated to prevent 1 death) <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute difference only (e.g. 5 fewer cases per 1000 women) <input type="checkbox"/> Ratio measure only (e.g. relative risk, relative change - % higher or lower; pop attr risk) <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____
	c) Are the data presented in the same numeric format (can be a subset) as the abstract ?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as abstract <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as abstract <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as abstract <input type="checkbox"/> No
	d) Are the data presented in the same numeric format (can be a subset) as the editor's note ? Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> No editor's note	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as editor's note <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as editor's note <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as editor's note <input type="checkbox"/> No
	e) Are the data presented in the same numeric format (can be a subset) as the press release ? Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> No press release	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as press release <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as press release <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as press release <input type="checkbox"/> No
	f) Were the numbers used correctly? g). If numbers used incorrectly , provide text used to describe the numbers & reason why it is incorrect:	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Unsure (not known where # is from) If unsure, put number: _____ Incorrect text: Reason incorrect	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Unsure (not known where # is from) If unsure, put number: _____ Incorrect text: Reason incorrect	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Unsure (not known where # is from) If unsure, put number: _____ Incorrect text: Reason incorrect

Article Code: _____ Coder initials: _____

Date coded : _____

C.	Harms	News story # _____	News story # _____	News story # _____
1.	Are relevant harms or adverse events mentioned?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
2.	If harms or adverse events are mentioned:			
	How are harms/adverse effects described? a) Single-person anecdote b) Numbers given	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
	c) If numbers are provided for harms, how are they given?	<input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk/means for more than one or all exposure groups <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk /mean for only one exposure group (e.g. 5% or 5 per 100 had strokes in the control group) <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for more than one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for only one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Number needed to treat (e.g. 500 need to be treated to prevent 1 death) <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute difference only (e.g. 5 fewer cases per 1000 women) <input type="checkbox"/> Ratio measure only (e.g. relative risk, relative change - % higher or lower; pop attr risk) <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____	<input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk/means for more than one or all exposure groups <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk /mean for only one exposure group (e.g. 5% or 5 per 100 had strokes in the control group) <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for more than one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for only one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Number needed to treat (e.g. 500 need to be treated to prevent 1 death) <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute difference only (e.g. 5 fewer cases per 1000 women) <input type="checkbox"/> Ratio measure only (e.g. relative risk, relative change - % higher or lower; pop attr risk) <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____	<input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk/means for more than one or all exposure groups <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute risk /mean for only one exposure group (e.g. 5% or 5 per 100 had strokes in the control group) <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for more than one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Person year rates for only one exposure group <input type="checkbox"/> Number needed to treat (e.g. 500 need to be treated to prevent 1 death) <input type="checkbox"/> Absolute difference only (e.g. 5 fewer cases per 1000 women) <input type="checkbox"/> Ratio measure only (e.g. relative risk, relative change - % higher or lower; pop attr risk) <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____
	c) Are harms presented in the same numeric format (can be a subset) as the abstract ?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as abstract <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as abstract <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as abstract <input type="checkbox"/> No
	d) Are harms presented in the same numeric format (can be a subset) as the editor's note ? Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> No editor's note	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as editor's note <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as editor's note <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as editor's note <input type="checkbox"/> No
	e) Are the data presented in the same numeric format (can be a subset) as the press release ? Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> No press release	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as press release <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as press release <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used correctly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same number used incorrectly <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, same format category as press release <input type="checkbox"/> No
	f) Were the numbers for harms used correctly?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Unsure (not known where # is from) If unsure, put number: _____ Incorrect text: _____	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Unsure (not known where # is from) If unsure, put number: _____ Incorrect text: _____	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Unsure (not known where # is from) If unsure, put number: _____ Incorrect text: _____
	g). If numbers used incorrectly , provide text used to describe the numbers & reason why it is incorrect:	Reason incorrect	Reason incorrect	Reason incorrect

Article Code: _____ Coder initials: _____

Date coded : _____

For limitations: If the question does not apply, mark the appropriate “opt out” choice from the first column and leave the rest of the row blank

D.	Limitations	News story # _____	News story # _____	News story # _____
1.	Is the study size given? (exact or approximate number)	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
2.	If the study is small (e.g. < 30 people) , are readers cautioned that larger studies are needed to really understand how much the intervention works? Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> Not a small study OR <input type="checkbox"/> No study size given in abstract	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
3.	If study has no control or comparison group , are readers cautioned that it is not known how much the intervention accounts for the findings? Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> Control/comparison group present <input type="checkbox"/> Study not intended to identify benefit of an intervention	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
4.	If study is a randomized trial , (randomized assignment to exposure groups), is that fact clearly identified? Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> Study is NOT a randomized trial	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
5.	If the study is a randomized trial , and the study was stopped early due to benefit (not harm), is there a caution that these studies often overestimate this benefit? Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> Study is NOT a randomized trial <input type="checkbox"/> Study is randomized but did NOT stop early for benefit	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
6.	If the study is NOT randomized , is the potential for confounding noted (e.g., in the analysis)? Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> Study IS a randomized trial <input type="checkbox"/> Confounding not applicable (no cause & effect implied, e.g., descriptive study)	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, explicitly (mentions confounding as a potential problem) <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, generally (mentions multivariate analysis, says “just an association” or “RCT needed”) <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, explicitly (mentions confounding as a potential problem) <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, generally (mentions multivariate analysis, says “just an association” or “RCT needed”) <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes, explicitly (mentions confounding as a potential problem) <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, generally (mentions multivariate analysis, says “just an association” or “RCT needed”) <input type="checkbox"/> No
7.	If cross-sectional study, is it noted that since the information is collected simultaneously, you cannot know whether the exposure causes the outcome (or vice-versa)? Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> Not a cross-sectional study or not simultaneous exposures & outcomes	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
8.	If study is a survey , a) is the response rate given? b) If the sample is not random (e.g., convenience or self-selected), is the reader cautioned about sample bias? Part b opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> Survey sample is random Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> Not a survey	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
9.	If the study is descriptive (e.g., no intervention, prevalence studies), is there a statement about how well the sample represents a larger population? Opt out: <input type="checkbox"/> Not a descriptive study	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

Article Code: _____ Coder initials: _____

Date coded : _____

D.	Limitations, continued	News story # _____	News story # _____	News story # _____
10.	<p>If diet/behavior/quality improvement intervention with multiple dimensions (type and/or duration vary), are readers cautioned that it is difficult to determine which dimension is responsible for the effect?</p> <p>Opt out:</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Drug study</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Study not intended to identify benefit of an intervention</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not a multiple intervention study</p>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
11.	<p>If the primary outcome is a surrogate marker (e.g., lab abnormality), are readers cautioned about extrapolating to health outcomes important to patients?</p> <p>Opt out:</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not a surrogate outcome</p>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
12.	<p>If primary outcome is a score or surrogate marker, are readers told whether the effect is clinically important or unimportant (or unknown)?</p> <p>a) Mentions this explicitly ("small" effect)</p> <p>b) If score, are numbers provided relative to entire score (0.6mm out of 10cm)?</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Opt out of b – score not relevant to this outcome</p> <p>Opt out:</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not a score/surrogate outcome</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Negative study (shows no difference)</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> No difference tested in the abstract</p>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
13.	<p>If the study is based on a decision model, is the hypothetical nature of the analysis clearly identified?</p> <p>Opt out:</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not a decision model</p>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
14.	<p>If the study is an animal or lab experiment, is there a caution about the limited applicability to human health?</p> <p>Opt out:</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Not an animal model or lab experiment</p>	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
15.	Is the study funding source stated?	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
16.	a. List the numbers for any limitation from the abstract/editor's note that are mentioned in the news story (see abstract/editor note form):			
	b. How many unique limitations from question 16a are mentioned in the news story (count the number of limitations listed above):			
	c. List any other limitations in the news story that are NOT mentioned in the abstract or editor's note?			

Any other comments or notes?